



HONDURAS DISSERTATION/THESIS PROJECT

HON-M05 Long-term changes in reef fish and benthic communities in a newly established marine protected area (MPA)

Frankie Smith | Marine Research Manager | frankie.smith@opwall.com

Coral reefs are highly dynamic and biologically diverse ecosystems of great conservation and economic value. Although coral reef fisheries make up less than 1% of global commercial fisheries, they contribute approximately 6 million tons of fish, valued in the region of \$6 billion, per year. Coral reef fisheries also supply food for over a billion people each year through subsistence, 85% of which are dependent upon the reefs for the majority of their protein. Thus, managing coral reef fisheries sustainably is critical to the economies of the countries where coral reefs are found, but also to the coastal communities that are heavily reliant on these fisheries for their daily sustenance.

Sustainable management of healthy reef fish populations is also essential for the continued functioning of the reef system as a whole. For example, overfishing important herbivores can decrease grazing pressures and ultimately result in phase shifts from coral dominated to algal dominated systems. Maintaining the dynamic equilibrium within coral reef systems is vital for ensuring both biological diversity and local fisheries are safeguarded. Thus, annual monitoring of economically and/or ecologically important species is essential for assessing the health of the reef system and to provide early warning signs of any negative trends in fish populations.

Tela Bay, on the Caribbean coast of the Honduran mainland, is home to one of the most unusual reef systems anywhere in the region. Named Banco Capiro, this reef exists under atypical environmental conditions, but boasts a percentage cover of live healthy coral that is one of the highest anywhere in the Caribbean. Despite this coral dominance amongst the benthic community, the associated fishery exhibits low abundance and diversity compared to more typical Caribbean reef systems nearby. In 2018, Tela Bay was designated as a new Marine Protected Area (MPA) by the Honduran government, in part thanks to data collected by the Operation Wallacea teams since 2013. Our data from 2019 onwards will then be used to assess the effectiveness of the new MPA, allowing managers to modify their conservation approach accordingly.

Traditionally, surveys of reef fish populations, as well as benthic and invertebrate community structure, have been conducted by underwater visual census (UVC) by a team of scuba divers. However, the recent development of stereo video equipment for surveying reef fish communities is allowing large volumes of data to be collected within a single dive and analysed in detail back in the laboratory. An added advantage of stereo video surveys (SVS) over UVC, or even surveys that use a single video camera, is that SVS allows the researcher to accurately measure the size of the fish observed on the transect with computer analysis. The ability to accurately assess fish size makes it possible to estimate and compare biomass of fish populations. Although fish size has often been approximated during UVC, it has been shown that these approximations introduce a large degree of error and, thus, it is very difficult to make reliable comparisons of fish biomass between areas. Therefore, SVS provides a sophisticated and novel approach to reef fish surveys that is allowing the first accurate assessment of the biomass of fish populations in Honduran reef systems.

Stereo Video Surveys (SVS) are carried out by a small team of scuba divers with the principal investigator operating the stereo video equipment. Up to six consecutive transects can be filmed per

dive using this method, although the actual number will depend on the dive site and the experience of the surveyors. On Banco Capiro these surveys are conducted at 10m and 15m depth, as the site is a deeper offshore rather than fringing reef system. Stereo-video footage is converted from MTS to AVI format using MTS converter and then analyzed using the program *EventMeasure*. Footage from the left and right cameras is then synchronized in *EventMeasure* so that the frames are perfectly aligned. Once the setup is complete, individual fish are identified by family, genus, and species, and lengths calculated from snout to base of tail.

In addition to collecting fish community data, students will use GoPro video cameras to conduct benthic surveys using line-point-intercept transect techniques. This will provide them with data pertaining to the health of the reef and enable them to make inferences about the relationships that exist between fish population structures and benthic community health and composition. From 2019, students may also be able to use cutting-edge 3D modelling technology in order to investigate how fish abundances and diversity are affected by the underlying architecture of the reef. This has potentially major implications for conservation as reef flattening processes in the Caribbean continue to gain momentum.

Students may design projects that look at differences in fish community assemblages, abundance and biomass within and between sites within Tela Bay, and also look at depth distributions and the impact of environment on shaping reef benthic and fish community structure. This project has been running for a number of years, and past data can be used to assess the health of the reef and associated fishery pre-MPA. New data collected in 2019 will be able to be used to make the first assessment of immediate impacts of the MPA.

Recommended Reading

Adam TC, Burkepile DE, Ruttenberg BI, Paddock MJ (2015) Herbivory and the resilience of Caribbean coral reefs: Knowledge gaps and implications for management. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 520

Andradi-Brown DA, Macaya-Solis C, Exton DA, Gress E, Wright G, Rogers AD (2016) Assessing Caribbean shallow and mesophotic reef fish communities using baited-remote underwater video (BRUV) and diver-operated video (DOV) survey techniques. *PLoS One* 11(12): e0168235

Barlow J, Franca F, Gardner TA, Hicks CC, Lennox GD, Berenguer E, Castello L, Economo EP, Joice F, Guenard B, Leal CG, Isaac V, Lees AC, Parr CL, Wilson SK, Young PJ, Graham NAJ (2018) The future of hyperdiverse tropical ecosystems. *Nature* 559: 517–526

Bodmer MDV, Rogers AD, Speight MR, Lubbock N, Exton DA (2015) Using an isolated population boom to explore barriers to recovery in the keystone Caribbean coral reef herbivore *Diadema antillarum*. *Coral Reefs* 34(4): 1011-1021

Bruno JF, Bates AE, Cacciapaglia C, Pike EP, Amstrup SC, Van Hooijdonk R, Henson SA, Aronson RB (2018) Climate change threatens the world's marine protected areas. *Nature Climate Change* 8

Campbell SJ, Edgar GJ, Stuart-Smith RD, Soler G, Bates AE (2018) Fishing-gear restrictions and biomass gains for coral reef fishes in marine protected areas. *Conservation Biology* 32: 401–410

Cinner JE, Huchery C, MacNeil MA, Graham NAJ, McClanahan TR, Maina J, Maire E, Kittinger JN, Hicks CC, Mora C, Allison EH, D'Agata S, Hoey A, Feary DA, Crowder L, Williams ID, Kulbicki M,

- Vigliola L, Wantiez L, Edgar G, Stuart-Smith RD, Sandin SA, Green AL, Hardt MJ, Beger M, Friedlander A, Campbell SJ, Holmes KE, Wilson SK, Brokovich E, Brooks AJ, Cruz-Motta JJ, Booth DJ, Chabanet P, Gough C, Tupper M, Ferse SCA, Sumaila UR, Mouillot D (2016) Bright spots among the world's coral reefs. *Nature* 535: 416–419
- Cox C, Valdivia A, McField M, Castillo K, Bruno JF (2017) Establishment of marine protected areas alone does not restore coral reef communities in Belize. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 563
- Edgar GJ, Stuart-Smith RD, Willis TJ, Kininmonth S, Baker SC, Banks S, Barrett NS, Becerro MA, Bernard ATF, Berkhout J, Buxton CD, Campbell SJ, Cooper AT, Davey M, Edgar SC, Försterra G, Galván DE, Irigoyen AJ, Kushner DJ, Moura R, Parnell PE, Shears NT, Soler G, Strain EMA, Thomson RJ (2014) Global conservation outcomes depend on marine protected areas with five key features. *Nature* 506: 7487
- Exton DA, Ahmadi GN, Cullen-Unsworth LC, Jompa J, May D, Rice J, Simonin PW, Unsworth RKF, Smith DJ (2019) Artisanal fish fences pose broad and unexpected threats to the tropical coastal seascape. *Nature Communications* 10: 2100
- Gill DA, Mascia MB, Ahmadi GN, Glew L, Lester SE, Barnes M, Craigie I, Darling ES, Free CM, Geldmann J, Holst S, Jensen OP, White AT, Basurto X, Coad L, Gates RD, Guannel G, Mumby PJ, Thomas H, Whitmee S, Woodley S, Fox HE (2017) Capacity shortfalls hinder the performance of marine protected areas globally. *Nature* 543: 665–669
- Goetze JS, Bond T, McLean DL, Saunders BJ, Langlois TJ, Lindfield S, Fullwood LAF, Driessen D, Shedrawi G, Harvey ES (2019) A field and video analysis guide for diver operated stereo-video. *Methods in Ecology and Evolution* 10: 1083–1090
- Hughes TP, Barnes ML, Bellwood DR, Cinner JE, Cumming GS, Jackson JBC, Kleypas J, Van De Leemput IA, Lough JM, Morrison TH, Palumbi SR, Van Nes EH, Scheffer M (2017) Coral reefs in the Anthropocene. *Nature* 546: 82–90
- Krueck NC, Legrand C, Ahmadi GN, Estradivari, Green A, Jones GP, Riginos C, Trembl EA, Mumby PJ (2017) Reserve Sizes Needed to Protect Coral Reef Fishes. *Conservation Letters* 1–9
- Mellin C, Macneil AM, Cheal AJ, Emslie MJ, Julian Caley M (2016) Marine protected areas increase resilience among coral reef communities. *Ecology Letters* 19: 629–637
- Mora C (2008) A clear human footprint in the coral reefs of the Caribbean. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B* 275: 767–773.
- Mumby PJ, Harborne AR (2010) Marine reserves enhance the recovery of corals on Caribbean reefs. *PLoS One* 5(1): e8657.
- Suchley A, Alvarez-Filip L (2018) Local human activities limit marine protection efficacy on Caribbean coral reefs. *Conservation Letters* 11(5)
- Young GC, Dey S, Rogers AD, Exton DA (2017) Cost and time-effective framework for multi-scale measures of rugosity, fractal dimension, and vector dispersion from coral reef 3D models. *PLoS One* 12(4): e0175341